



NEW ZEALAND **QUALIFICATIONS** AUTHORITY
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

QUALIFY FOR THE FUTURE WORLD
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

External Evaluation and Review Report



Bakels Training School

Date of report: 14 July 2021

About Bakels Training School

Bakels' apprentice baker training involves distance learning, block courses and on-job training. All trainees have a formal apprenticeship agreement with their employer and Competenz.¹ Bakels' tutors design and deliver theory and practical training in block courses, and also moderate the assigned on-job verifiers. In addition, bakery advisors employed by Bakels visit workplaces to monitor and encourage each trainee's progress between block courses.

Type of organisation:	Private training establishment (PTE)
Location:	421-429 Church Street East, Penrose, Auckland
Code of Practice signatory:	N/A
Number of trainees:	As at January 2021, Bakels Training School had 210 trainees enrolled: 48 per cent NZ European, 17 per cent Asian, 13 per cent Māori, 8 per cent Indian, 8 per cent Pasifika and 6 per cent identified as 'Other'. All of these are domestic trainees.
Number of staff:	Five full-time and three part-time staff
TEO profile:	NZ Bakels Ltd (NZQA website)
Last EER outcome:	At the previous external evaluation and review (EER) visit, conducted in December 2016, NZQA was Highly Confident in Bakels' educational performance, and Highly Confident in their capability in self-assessment.
Scope of this evaluation:	One focus area: Apprentice Baker Training, which reflects the purpose and operations of the PTE, and almost all training delivery.
MoE number:	7945
NZQA reference:	C45314
Dates of EER visit:	21 and 22 April 2021 (via Zoom)

¹ Transitional industry training organisation

Summary of results

Bakels continues to maintain a clear understanding of its industry and the needs of stakeholders and trainees. The PTE delivers apprentice support and training in ways that effectively meet those needs. There is well-structured planning, process and review documentation, and internal and external communications. The academic quality functions and processes are effective. Self-assessment is embedded and effective, with only a few suggested areas to strengthen as identified by NZQA.

Highly Confident in Bakels educational performance

The qualifications offered, with their strands and levels, are current, approved by NZQA, and appropriate to the needs of apprentices and the wider baking industry.²

Engagement with industry stakeholders is strong, ongoing and informs all aspects of the training offered. It also informs the PTE's understanding of apprentice training and support needs.

Highly Confident in Bakels capability in self-assessment

There are steady rates of programme completion year-on-year, which meets Competenz expectations.³ Data sharing is effective, systematic and well documented. There is improved use of self-assessment based on timely and accurate learner progress data.

The PTE is well led and staffed, with a recent increase in resources within the academic quality function. Investment in training facilities is also ongoing, and further significant upgrades are planned.

Bakels has a particular strength in gathering, analysing, presenting and responding to trainee feedback. The trainees' experience of their training is actively sought and is used to drive improvement.

Documentation sampled by NZQA – including achievement data, advisory board minutes, lesson plans, trainee course handbooks, survey analyses and assessment records – are of good quality, cover all areas of the operation, and are up to date.

² New Zealand Certificate in Trade Baking Craft or Plant (Levels 3 and 4) with strands available in Bread, Cake, Biscuit, Pastry. Bakels offers approved programmes owned by Competenz.

³ Bakels' annual contract with Competenz includes key performance indicators.

Key evaluation question findings⁴

1.1 How well do trainees achieve?

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>The key findings regarding trainees' achievement are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 25 trainees completed their qualification in the period April 2020 to April 2021 (see Appendix 1 for more detail) • The training has direct application to the workplace. It includes food hygiene, safety, productivity and efficiency content, as well as technical baking skills and techniques. • It includes embedded literacy and numeracy content. <p>There is a positive increase in Māori and Pasifika participation in the apprentice baker training, and also an increasing diversification of the cohort. Māori and/or Pasifika trainees now account for 21 per cent of enrolments, an increase from 9 per cent in 2016. The gender balance has also improved since the last EER; female apprentices now comprise 47 per cent of enrolments. Although there is strong evidence that migrant learners achieve well – such as the Cambodian and other learners from non-English speaking backgrounds – analysis of data relating to TES Priority Group Learners⁵ is not yet robust enough to compare their performance with other groups.</p> <p>There is ongoing monitoring and year-by-year benchmarking, with an emphasis on tracking enrolments, completions, withdrawals and ethnicity. Numbers of withdrawals have increased annually; this is reportedly most prevalent in supermarket apprenticeships. Bakels could more robustly monitor this (see Recommendations).</p> <p>Achievement data is centrally managed and shared through regular, minuted self-assessment meetings with senior management, bakery advisors, the advisory board and Competenz. Bakels is currently sourcing a student management system, which should provide more powerful</p>

⁴ The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

⁵ Māori, Pasifika, those under-25 years of age, trainees with a disability.

	reporting tools than those currently being used.
Conclusion:	There continues to be steady rates of achievement of qualifications year-on-year, and increased enrolment of priority group learners. The pass rates satisfy Competenz, as Bakels continues to meet its contracted key performance indicators.

1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including learners?

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Excellent
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>Bakels' training makes an ongoing contribution to the quality and availability of basic foodstuffs production in New Zealand. Industry contacts told NZQA of a shortage of tradespeople, and that this is now being addressed. 'Baker' has at times been an Immigration New Zealand skills shortage category prioritised for work visas because of persistent employment vacancies.</p> <p>The qualifications offered and programmes are relatively new.⁶ The content and structure are current and have been subject to recent review by industry and other stakeholders.</p> <p>There is direct application of the training to the workplace; in some cases, this is the trainee's own business. The block course feedback form seeks comment on learning transfer, asking what trainees will do differently at work as a result of their training. Trainee feedback is routinely reviewed at self-assessment meetings and has led to changes and refinements.</p> <p>It was clear from interviews with trainees, graduates and stakeholders that the training is broadly based. Trainees are trained and qualified in products they may not routinely make at work, which extends the training beyond any possible workplace limitations. The qualification strands and block courses are intentionally structured to facilitate this breadth of training.</p> <p>The PTE's bakery advisors visit all sites where their apprentices are employed. This offers Bakels unique, ongoing contact with all three of the defined forms of bakery (retail, plant, supermarket) and a view of their needs and wants. The PTE tracks these contacts, which also provide a good source of</p>

⁶ The National certificates were 'taught out in 2020'; all programmes are now post-the Targeted Review of Qualifications.

	graduate outcome information. Bakels also sponsors industry-wide competitions.
Conclusion:	Industry demand for apprentices in the baking trade is being increasingly well met, and Bakels is one of the few tertiary education organisations in this field of training. Trainees and graduates describe personal satisfaction, professional development and increased earnings as outcomes. Some graduates have or are launching their own businesses, and/or have won national awards.

1.3 How well do programme design and delivery, including learning and assessment activities, match the needs of trainees and other relevant stakeholders?

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>Bakels offers up-to-date qualifications. The PTE was involved, along with the wider industry, in designing the content and strands. The focus area training programmes are unit standards-based, and consist of 102 to 210 credits each, depending on the qualification. This suits the industry sectors well as they were involved in the design of the qualifications.</p> <p>Learning materials such as course books and block/lesson plans appear robust and easy to follow to aid consistency of delivery at the three block venues.⁷ A stakeholder familiar with the materials stated that improvements had been made since 2016. The lesson plans all contain aims and learning outcomes (which are linked to sections of unit standards); these are identified for each lesson and specific task. Some customisation of the training occurs to meet the needs of larger businesses such as manufacturing plants. Regular and purposeful contact with stakeholders occurs regarding the appropriate design and delivery of the training.</p> <p>Block course numbers are kept small⁸, which allows for more time and attention per student. Time is built into the blocks to engage with each student on their progress. The teaching is shaped by an understanding that trainees are practically orientated, and learning by reading/writing is not a preference for</p>

⁷ Auckland, Palmerston North and Christchurch.

⁸ Eight in Auckland, six in Palmerston North and seven in Christchurch.

	<p>many. Scheduling of block courses also considers factors that impact student attendance, such as industry competitions and school holidays. The trainees exhibit a high work ethic and often work challenging hours while studying or running a business, so some attrition is understandable.</p> <p>Monitoring and review/self-assessment sources of evidence considered by the evaluators include: peer observations of block course teaching; teacher professional development records and plans; internal moderation records (for which the volume, process robustness and recording were found to be at least good); and Competenz moderation findings since the last EER. Competenz has pre-moderated assessments for 25 unit standards, and has approved 24; assessments for seven unit standards were post-moderated, with three of these approved.</p> <p>A comprehensive example of recent self-assessment outcomes was the development of learning resources (with assessments) for year 3 cake and biscuit, and pastry block courses. These were pre-moderated and approved for use by Competenz in September and October 2020.</p>
Conclusion:	<p>Programme leadership, teaching and academic quality are effective. There is structured planning, good documentation and high quality physical and technical resources to support teachers and trainees. A commitment to quality and improvement is evident. There is some room for improvement in summative assessment, based on agreement rates with Competenz moderators.</p>

1.4 How effectively are trainees supported and involved in their learning?

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Excellent
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>Bakels offers targeted, ongoing support to the bakery apprentices. The role of the bakery advisors, who visit businesses and their apprentices on a schedule, is a key strength, as are the carefully constructed block courses. 'Help-desk' and pastoral advice is also provided by the small central administration and academic quality team. As well as being a conduit for industry awareness back to the PTE, baking advisors are kept up to date with trainee progress by central administration. This is a well-refined system. The efficacy and</p>

	<p>value of this support is consistently reflected in the student surveys and was attested to by graduates interviewed by NZQA.</p> <p>There was extensive, successful follow-up and assistance provided to all trainees who were finishing expiring programmes in 2020. The same can be said about support through the COVID-19 pandemic. One student interviewed by NZQA also offered a specific example of a colleague with an intellectual and physical disability being adapted to and well supported by teachers to succeed at the block course.</p> <p>Paper-based literacy and numeracy pre-tests occur at the first year 1 block course to identify trainees who may require assistance with written work. This is no longer a contracted requirement, but Bakels see this as 'good practice'. More could probably be done here though, as the further value or utility of the test results is unclear. The recent contracting of a suitably qualified resource developer with a qualification in embedding literacy is timely.</p> <p>Cohorts of trainees are formed during block courses. Bakels tries to keep the same trainees together throughout their study to encourage study and social networks. Trainees receive assessment results within five days, and trainees and graduates said the feedback they received on assessments, resits and course requirements is clear and helpful.</p> <p>The PTE has self-reviewed against the new domestic pastoral Code of Practice, and staff are participating in seminars on implementing it.</p>
<p>Conclusion:</p>	<p>This key evaluation question in many ways captures the essence of Bakels' successful training delivery. On-job learning is supplemented and supported by mentoring visits and direct teaching and assessment at block courses. This is all conducted in a supportive, suitably structured, goal-orientated manner, leading to sound educational achievement.</p>

1.5 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Excellent
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>Bakels PTE has a clear strategy and well-defined function within the baking industry, which is founded on the capability and resources of the parent company. Management values the training and strongly supports it. Funding is allocated to ensure it remains at the required quality and is meeting the challenges of growth in apprentice numbers. There are appropriate facilities with credible plans to invest in developing those further.</p> <p>Bakels' vision is to be 'the trainer of choice'; management sees apprentice training as essential to ensuring skills and industry longevity. The views of an advisory board are sought in twice-yearly meetings, and the board is provided with comprehensive and candid information on educational achievement, student feedback, curriculum, changes and improvements, and future plans. One example of significant, considered change is the new student management system, which has been trialled.</p> <p>Staffing has increased to cater to growth in numbers. Staff are valued and their opinions are sought in decision-making. An annual staff conference provides an opportunity for bakery advisors and tutors to network and debrief with central staff.</p> <p>Self-assessment tools and processes are actively used to plan and deliver training and gather student and stakeholder feedback. The training school administrator's report was one of the strongest examples. Data use is currently sound and is being improved. Self-assessment meeting minutes vary; some have limited review content and do not always explicitly consider data. Others are very comprehensive. Actions and their responsibility and timing are mostly clearly stated.</p> <p>Cyclical reviews, or annual reporting of key performance areas, are largely ongoing and relatively informal. Nevertheless, the delegation of operational roles works well. Illustrating this are the staff performance reviews, capital allocation processes and health and safety oversight of training venues – all occurring in alignment with the parent company's larger-scale human resources department.</p> <p>One of the impacts of COVID-19 was that block courses were</p>

	<p>cancelled during the level 3 and 4 lockdowns. However, due to the 'higher gearing' of blocks early in 2020⁹, and nimble use of time between and after the lockdowns, all rescheduled blocks were delivered by the end of 2020 with no residual carryover into 2021, and no significant loss of trainees.</p> <p>Bakels responded well to an unpredictable situation; some bakery advisors even 'embedded' into bakeries and assisted as essential workers alongside apprentices and/or graduates. Contact with learners was ongoing and appreciated, according to NZQA interviews with trainees and industry contacts.</p>
Conclusion:	<p>The PTE is maintaining its focus on the quality of delivery within a very clearly defined and relatively narrow scope of training. The PTE is servicing Competenz and the industry well, based on an embedded understanding of industry needs. Achievement is strong, as is self-assessment.</p>

1.6 How effectively are important compliance accountabilities managed?

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Good
Findings and supporting evidence:	<p>Bakels has a highly satisfactory record of managing and meeting its compliance accountabilities. Examples include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Maintaining alignment with the contract for service with Competenz. This contract, and the specific reporting regime to Competenz, structures the programme delivery in line with Competenz' awareness of NZQA programme approval rules, and also Tertiary Education Commission funding rules which underpin apprenticeships. • Self-assessment meeting minutes capture discussion of compliance-related aspects, and actions, on an ongoing basis. • No delays or concerns were noted for the routine documentation supplied to NZQA as part of maintaining registration. • Unit standard reporting to NZQA since the last EER meets all requirements.

⁹ This was to facilitate apprentices completing expiring qualifications.

	<p>That said, Bakels needed a prompt from NZQA Approvals and Accreditation to obtain an approved training scheme, as their last approved programme was expiring at the end of 2020. The PTE had been advised – correctly – by Competenz that they did not need to get a new qualification approval as they are delivering by contract to Competenz apprentices. However, a knowledge gap emerged at the PTE, as Bakels did require a training scheme approval to maintain registration.¹⁰</p>
<p>Conclusion:</p>	<p>Compliance management is effective, with the only weakness detected in this evaluation around knowledge of an NZQA rule for maintaining registration. This has been rectified by Bakels.</p>

¹⁰ A training scheme entitled health and safety, and food safety practices in a commercial bakery was developed by Bakels and approved by NZQA in March 2021.

Focus areas

This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.

2.1 Focus area: Apprentice Baker Training

Performance:	Excellent
Self-assessment:	Excellent

Recommendations

Recommendations are not compulsory, but their implementation may improve the quality and effectiveness of the training and education provided by the tertiary education organisation (TEO). They may be referred to in subsequent external evaluation and reviews (EERs) to gauge the effectiveness of the TEO's quality improvements over time.

NZQA recommends that Bakels:

- In (partnership with Competenz) jointly monitor apprentice withdrawals, with a view to evidencing their work with the industry to improve that indicator, and that improvements are measurable.
- Consider ways of enhancing the value to trainees and tutors of the literacy and numeracy pre-assessment tools and process. Link that to enhancing the literacy embedding strategies currently occurring. Bakels could consider implementing additional professional development (NZCALNE¹¹ or similar) for all tutors; there may be benefits in this for all learner groups, not least those from a non-English speaking background.

Requirements

Requirements relate to the TEO's statutory obligations under legislation that governs their operation. These include NZQA Rules and relevant regulations promulgated by other agencies.

There are no requirements arising from the external evaluation and review.

¹¹ [New Zealand Certificate in Adult Literacy and Numeracy Education \(Educator\) \(Level 5\)](#)

Appendix 1

Additional commentary and detail on achievement in this mode of training at Bakels, supplied by the PTE.

'As stated under key evaluation question 1: "25 trainees completed their qualification in the period April 2020 to April 2021".

Additional notes:

- 1. National certificate qualifications expired in December 2020, therefore completion numbers before the end of 2020 are made up mainly of trainees who completed those qualifications before they expired.*
- 2. In the period April 2018 to April 2019, 23 trainees completed.*
- 3. In the period April 2019 to April 2020, 18 trainees completed.*
- 4. On average, trainees were 41 months in training before completion. (This refers to the National certificate qualifications. This training duration will be greatly reduced going forward as the new New Zealand certificates are shorter, with elective strands.)'*

Appendix 2

Conduct of external evaluation and review

All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published rules. The methodology used is described in the web document <https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/>. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.

Disclaimer

The findings in this report have been reached by means of a standard evaluative process. They are based on a representative selection of focus areas, and a sample of supporting information provided by the TEO under review or independently accessed by NZQA. As such, the report's findings offer a guide to the relative quality of the TEO at the time of the EER, in the light of the known evidence, and the likelihood that this level of quality will continue.

For the same reason, these findings are always limited in scope. They are derived from selections and samples evaluated at a point in time. The supporting methodology is not designed to:

- *Identify organisational fraud¹²*
- *Provide comprehensive coverage of all programmes within a TEO, or of all relevant evidence sources*
- *Predict the outcome of other reviews of the same TEO which, by posing different questions or examining different information, could reasonably arrive at different conclusions.*

¹² NZQA and the Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) comprehensively monitor risk in the tertiary education sector through a range of other mechanisms. When fraud, or any other serious risk factor, has been confirmed, corrective action is taken as a matter of urgency.

Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

External evaluation and review is conducted under the Quality Assurance (including External Evaluation and Review (EER)) Rules 2016, which are made by NZQA under section 452(1)(t) of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister of Education.

Self-assessment and participation and cooperation in external evaluation and review are requirements for:

- *maintaining accreditation to provide an approved programme for all TEOs other than universities, and*
- *maintaining consent to assess against standards on the Directory of Assessment Standards for all TEOs including ITOs but excluding universities, and*
- *maintaining training scheme approval for all TEOs other than universities.*

The requirements for participation and cooperation are set through the Programme Approval and Accreditation Rules 2018, the Consent to Assess Against Standards Rules 2011 and the Training Scheme Rules 2012 respectively.

In addition, the Private Training Establishment Rules 2018 require registered private training establishments to undertake self-assessment and participate in external evaluation and review as a condition of maintaining registration.

NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes, training schemes and consents to assess and registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.

This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the Quality Assurance (including External Evaluation and Review (EER)) Rules 2016. The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.

External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website (www.nzqa.govt.nz). All rules cited above are available at <https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/about-us/our-role/legislation/nzqa-rules/>, while information about the conduct and methodology for external evaluation and review can be found at <https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/>.

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz

www.nzqa.govt.nz